## GOVERNMENT OF JAMMU AND KASHMIR JAMMU AND KASHMIR SERVICES SELECTION BOARD

CPO Chowk, Panjthirthi, Jammu/Zamzam Complex, Rambagh, Srinagar (www.jkssb.nic.in)

Order No: 355 - SSB of 2024 Dated: 18.10.2024

Subject:

O.A. No. 1597/2023 titled Ajmal Humayun VS UT of J&K, for the post of Works Supervisor in the Public Works (R&B) Department, advertised vide Notification No. 05 of 2020 dated 24.12.2020, under Item Nos. 134 – Consideration Order thereof.

Whereas, upon the receipt of Indent/requisition from the Public Works (R&B) Department vide Indent No. PW(R&B)NG/124/2019 dated 30.09.2020, followed by Indent No. PW(R&B)NG/124/2019 dated 17.12.2020, the process of making direct recruitment to the 76 posts of **Works Supervisor** was set in motion; and

Whereas, the J&K Services Selection Board (JKSSB), advertised the said 76 posts of Works Supervisor, vide Notification No.05 of 2020 dated 24.12.2020, under Item No. 134; and

Whereas, the requisite qualification for the post was <u>Matric pass or its</u> <u>equivalent from any recognized Board or university and ITI certificate in Building</u> <u>Construction or Carpentry Trade</u>, and

Whereas, the Provisional Selection List for the aforementioned posts was notified vide No. SSB/Secy/Sel/WS-2023/299-304 dated 23.02.2022 and the Final Selection List was notified vide No. JKSSB/Scry/05/2023-01 (E-7240477) dated 01.11.2023, respectively, while the recommendations were forwarded to the Public Works (R&B) Department vide letter No. JKSSB/Scry/5/2023-01(E-7240477) dated 20.11.2023; and

Whereas, in the instant selection to the post of Works Supervisor, Public Works (R&B) Department, Divisional Cadre, Kashmir, advertised vide Notification No. 05 of 2020 dated 24.12.2020, under Item No. 134, the selection at S. No. 2, under PSP category of one candidate namely Mr. Nasir Ahmed was called in question by the applicant Mr. Ajmal Humayun through some representations. The applicant was specifically questioning the authenticity of the certificate produced by Mr. Nasir Ahmed. Pertinent to mention that the applicant Mr. Ajmal Humayun also sought the remedy from Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jammu, regarding the issue by filing the instant OA No. 1597/2023, titled Ajmal Humayun Vs UT of J&K and others. The said case was listed in the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jammu Bench, on 07.12.2023 and the Hon'ble CAT disposed of the OA with the following directions:

"Mr. Rahul Pant, learned Sr. Counsel for the applicant submitted that the J&K Service Selection Board had issued Advertisement Notice No. 05 of 2020 dated 24.12.2020 calling applications from eligible candidates for filling up various posts in various departments including 76 posts of Works Supervisors in Public Works (R&B) Department. Out of 76 posts of Work Supervisor, 03 were in the

Pahari Speaking People (PSP) Category. The applicant being fully qualified, applied under the PSP category and participated in the selection process. Vide Notification dated 23.02.2023, a provisional select list was issued. In this provisional select list, three candidates were shown to be selected under the PSP category and the applicant's name was shown at Serial No. 1 in the waiting list. The candidature of one selected candidate namely Nasir Ahmed figuring at Serial No. 2 under the PSP category was shown to have been withheld due to non-production of bonafide certificate as per Board format and recognition status of the institute from where the candidate has obtained the relevant trade certificate. Thereafter, a final selection list dated 01.11.2023 was issued. In this list also, the candidature of Nasir Ahmed figuring at Serial No. 2 under the PSP category was shown to have been withheld. 2. It is the contention of learned Sr. Counsel that the applicant has obtained information from RTI as well as inquired from AICTE and has come to know that the institute from where the aforesaid Nasir Ahmed has obtained his under these Hence, recognized. trade certificate is not circumstances, the respondents ought to have selected the applicant as he is at Serial No. 1 in the Waiting List. In this regard, the applicant also submitted various representations, however, no decision has been taken by the respondents uptil now. Hence, the present Original Application under Section 19 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985.

- 3. Learned Sr. Counsel further submitted that the Original Application can be disposed of with a direction to respondents to consider the case of the applicant for appointment on the post of Work Supervisor under the PSP Category.
- 4. Mr. Sudesh Magotra, learned Additional Advocate General for the respondents opposed the prayer of the applicant and prayed for some time to file the counter affidavit.
- 5. Heard learned counsels for the parties.
- 6. Keeping in view the submissions made by learned counsels for the parties, I am of the opinion that no fruitful purpose will be served in keeping this Original Application pending and the same can be disposed of.
- 7. Accordingly, the Original Application is disposed of, at the admission stage, without entering into the merits of the case with a direction to Respondents No. 2 & 3 to take a decision with regard to candidature of Nasir Ahmed whose name is figuring at Serial No. 2 in the list of selected candidates under the PSP category and whose candidature has been withheld due to non-production of bonafide trade certificate. In case, the respondents are of the view that the aforesaid Nasir Ahmed is not eligible for appointment, the case of the applicant herein, who is figuring at Serial No. 1 in the Waiting List, shall be considered, for appointment as Work Supervisor. The respondents shall pass a reasoned and speaking order in this regard within a period of twelve days from today.
- 8. Ordered accordingly.
- 9. However, there shall be no orders as to costs. "

Whereas, the case was again listed on dated **26.07.2024** and the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jammu, passed the following directions:

"Mr. Rahul Pant, Sr. adv. submitted that document no. 1411 of 2024 has been filed for placing on record some documents to establish that the ITI certificate produced by the selected candidate is fake. Copy of the same has already been furnished to Mr. Hunar Gupta, learned DAG, who shall file the fresh status report in the matter before the next date of hearing.

List on 16.08.2024."

The Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jammu further, in its Order dated **24.09.2024**, directed that:

"Despite five opportunities have already been granted compliance report has not been filed by the contemnors.

Mr. Hunar Gupta, learned DAG is granted four weeks' time as a matter of last opportunity to file compliance report, failing which the Secretary, SSRB shall remain present before this Tribunal on the next date of hearing along with records and to explain why they have not filed the compliance report till date.

Issue show cause notice to explain why contempt proceedings be not initiated against them for not complying the order of this Tribunal.

List the case on 19.10.2024."

Whereas, the candidature of the candidate, namely, **Mr. Nasir Ahmed figuring** at Serial No. 2 under the PSP category, was kept withheld in the Final Selection List, with the reasons recorded as, "Recommendation withheld subject to the production of Bonafide Certificate as per Board format and Recognition status of the Institute from where the candidate has obtained the relevant trade certificate", and

Whereas, in its 278<sup>th</sup> Board Meeting, the Board decided to take up the matter regarding the recognition status of the institutes from where the trade certificates of such candidates whose recommendations were withheld due to the aforementioned reason, with the Indenting Department and the name of the candidate (**Mr. Nasir Ahmed figuring at Serial No. 2 under the PSP category in the selection list**) also featured at S. No. 20 in the said communication. In response to the Board communication, the Indenting Department, vide its letter No. PWD-NGAZOCIV/232/2023-05 dated 29.08.2024, intimated as below:

"...request you to take up the matter with the concerned Institute/universities for ascertaining the recognition of such institutes at your own level, as the same is the mandate of the Recruiting Agency".

Whereas, the above response from the Indenting Department was placed in the Board in its 285<sup>th</sup> Meeting held on 15.10.2024, wherein after due deliberations, it was decided to discuss threadbare with Skill Development Department, the various issues in such

like cases where recommendations of candidates, though figuring in the Selection List, were kept withheld on account of clarification required about the recognition status and validity of the trade certificates from various institutions particularly located outside the UT of J&K. In this respect it was decided to call a meeting of the officers of Skill Development Department and discuss the issues in detail; and

Whereas, the above said meeting with the officers of Skill Development Department with the officers of the JKSSB was arranged on 16.10.2024, in the JKSSB Central Office, Jammu and the case of Mr. Nasir Ahmed, among other such cases, was deliberated upon and detailed scrutiny of the submitted documents was undertaken. The case of Mr. Nasir Ahmed, in the said meeting, was found wanting in many aspects and hence rejected with detailed reasons.; and

Whereas, the report/record note from the said meeting held between the officers of JKSSB and the officers of the Skill Development was placed in the 286th Board Meeting which was held on 18.10.2024, wherein the Board after scrutinising the record placed before it decided to reject the case of the private respondent by passing a reasoned and speaking order.

Now, therefore, in view of the above & having due regard to the Order dated 24.09.2024, passed by the Hon'ble Central Administrative Tribunal, Jammu Bench, and decision taken by the Board, the case of the candidate Mr. Nasir Ahmed figuring at Serial No. 2, under the PSP category, in the Final Selection List for the aforementioned posts of Works Supervisor, is hereby rejected as the certificate issuing institute namely Swami Vivekanand Institute of Technology and Management(SVITM) is not recognized by National Council for Vocational Training (NCVT) and State Council for Vocational Training (SCVT) respectively and the Bonafide certificate produced by the candidate in response to the JKSSB notice No. JKSSB-LEG/284/2023-03(E-7282343) dated 06.05.2024, does not mention the affiliation of the said institute (SVITM) with any recognised Board/Council.

Also, the said Institute has furnished no reply to the Board's communication No. JKSSB-Legal/284/2023-03 (E-7282343) dated 06.05.2024, addressed to Registrar/Controller of examinations SVITM, New Delhi. Due notice of the representation of the applicant, who has filed an RTI with the Ministry of Skill Development and entrepreneurship, was also taken by the Board, wherein the reply tendered mentions that the said institute is not registered on NCVT MIS Portal. Hence, the case Mr. Nasir Ahmed is duly considered and is being rejected on the grounds of non-possession of the requisite qualification for the said post.

By Order.

J&K Services Selection Board.

Dated: 18.10.2024

No: JKSSB-Legal/284/2023-03 (E-7282343)

Copy to:

1. Secretary to the Government, PW(R&B), Department, for information please.

2. Private Secretary to Chairperson, J&K Services Selection Board.

3. Record file.